Ruby - Bug #20790

Syntax acceptance of `*x = p rescue p 1` is different between parse.y and prism

10/09/2024 03:53 AM - tompng (tomoya ishida)

Status:	Open		
Priority:	Normal		
Assignee:			
Target version:			
ruby -v:	ruby 3.4.0dev (2024-10-09T03:27:05Z master ed11a244dd) +PRISM [x86_64-linux]	**Backport:**	3.1: UNKNOWN, 3.2: UNKNOWN, 3.3: UNKNOWN

Description

```
*x = p rescue p 1 # syntax error in prism
*x = p 1 rescue p 1 # both syntax ok
x = p rescue p 1 # both syntax error
x = p 1 rescue p 1 # both syntax ok
```

Which is correct? If *x = p rescue p 1 is syntax valid, should x = p rescue p 1 also be syntax valid?

Related issues:

Related to Ruby - Bug #8279: Single-line rescue parsing	**Closed**

History

#1 - 11/07/2024 08:29 AM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Related to Bug #8279: Single-line rescue parsing added

#2 - 11/07/2024 10:36 AM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

Discussed at the dev meeting. Here is matz's preference.

```
                    # current parse.y behavior  # matz's preference
*x = p rescue p 1   # (*x = p) rescue (p 1)      # *x = (p rescue (p 1))
*x = p 1 rescue p 1 # (*x = p 1) rescue (p 1)    # *x = ((p 1) rescue (p 1))
a, b = p rescue p   # a, b = (p rescue p)        # as is
x = p rescue p      # x = (p rescue p)           # as is
x = p rescue p 1    # x = (p rescue p) 1 (ERROR) # x = (p rescue p 1)
x = p 1 rescue p 1  # x = ((p 1) rescue (p 1))   # as is
```

@yui-knk (Kaneko Yuichiro) @kddnewton (Kevin Newton) What do you think?

#3 - 11/08/2024 03:45 PM - kddnewton (Kevin Newton)

That makes sense to me, we can make that work.

#4 - 11/25/2024 10:58 AM - ydah (Yudai Takada)

I checked if it is feasible with parse.y: https://github.com/ydah/ruby/commit/50100c136ac4bbe379b2c360994b739227610e17

I have been able to confirm that the following are feasible with the modifications shown above.

```
                    # current parse.y behavior  # matz's preference
*x = p rescue p 1   # (*x = p) rescue (p 1)      # *x = (p rescue (p 1))
*x = p 1 rescue p 1 # (*x = p 1) rescue (p 1)    # *x = ((p 1) rescue (p 1))
a, b = p rescue p   # a, b = (p rescue p)        # as is
x = p rescue p      # x = (p rescue p)           # as is
x = p 1 rescue p 1  # x = ((p 1) rescue (p 1))   # as is
```

The following are still under investigation for feasibility.

```
                    # current parse.y behavior  # matz's preference
x = p rescue p 1    # x = (p rescue p) 1 (ERROR) # x = (p rescue p 1)
```