

Ruby - Bug #18770

Inconsistent behavior of IO/StringIO's each methods when called with nil as a separator, limit and chomp: true

05/10/2022 01:29 PM - andrykonchin (Andrew Konchin)

Status:Closed Priority:Normal Assignee: Target version: ruby -v:3.0.3	Backport:2.7: UNKNOWN, 3.0: UNKNOWN, 3.1: UNKNOWN
Description IO's and StringIO's #each method (and similar ones - #gets, #readline etc) behave in a different way in the following case: • separator is nil • limit is passed • chomp: true passed In this case StringIO#each removes trailing \n but IO#each does not: <pre>StringIO.new("abc\n\ndef\n").each(nil, 2, chomp: true).to_a #=> ["ab", "c", "\nd", "ef", ""]</pre> <pre>File.open('chomp.txt').each(nil, 2, chomp: true).to_a #=> ["ab", "c\n", "\nd", "ef", "\n"]</pre> The file has the same content: <pre>File.read('chomp.txt'); #=> "abc\n\ndef\n"</pre> Expected behavior - both methods return the same result.	
Related issues: Related to Ruby - Bug #18768: Inconsistent behavior of IO, StringIO and Strin...Closed	

Associated revisions

Revision [adaaf12857ce41d35b282e3fb5aa330934ce45c6](#) - 05/30/2022 04:01 AM - [jeremyevans](#) (Jeremy Evans)

[ruby/stringio] Ignore chomp keyword for nil separator

nil separator means no separator at all, so nothing should be chomped.

Partial fix for Ruby [Bug #18770]

<https://github.com/ruby/stringio/commit/feaa2ec631>

Revision [adaaf12857ce41d35b282e3fb5aa330934ce45c6](#) - 05/30/2022 04:01 AM - [jeremyevans](#) (Jeremy Evans)

[ruby/stringio] Ignore chomp keyword for nil separator

nil separator means no separator at all, so nothing should be chomped.

Partial fix for Ruby [Bug #18770]

<https://github.com/ruby/stringio/commit/feaa2ec631>

Revision [adaaf128](#) - 05/30/2022 04:01 AM - [jeremyevans](#) (Jeremy Evans)

[ruby/stringio] Ignore chomp keyword for nil separator

nil separator means no separator at all, so nothing should be chomped.

Partial fix for Ruby [Bug #18770]

<https://github.com/ruby/stringio/commit/feaa2ec631>

Revision 04f86ad0b5d2fe4711ff300d855228a6aed55f33 - 07/21/2022 03:13 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]

Revision 04f86ad0b5d2fe4711ff300d855228a6aed55f33 - 07/21/2022 03:13 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]

Revision 04f86ad0 - 07/21/2022 03:13 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]

Revision 7223c0da152114c84e1c4261a282faaea21646fb - 07/21/2022 07:55 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]

Revision 7223c0da152114c84e1c4261a282faaea21646fb - 07/21/2022 07:55 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]

Revision 7223c0da - 07/21/2022 07:55 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]

History

#1 - 05/26/2022 06:42 PM - jeremyevans0 (Jeremy Evans)

- Related to Bug #18768: Inconsistent behavior of IO, StringIO and String each_line methods when return_paragraph and chomp: true passed added

#2 - 05/26/2022 09:28 PM - jeremyevans0 (Jeremy Evans)

I think both IO#each and StringIO#each behavior is wrong when combining nil with chomp. My opinion is that a nil separator means there is no separator at all, and therefore chomp should either raise an error or be ignored if nil is the separator. Assuming that ignoring chomp is desired behavior for nil separator, it follows:

- IO#each behavior for nil and chomp with a limit is correct. However, IO#each for nil and chomp without a limit is not, since it removes a final line separator.
- StringIO#each behavior for nil and chomp is wrong, regardless of whether a limit is used.

This issue is related to String#each_line, but the nil and chomp combination there is handled correctly, not removing any characters (it doesn't support limit).

Note that Ruby has current tests for the IO#each behavior for nil and chomp without limit removing the trailing line separator. So the current behavior for that is definitely expected, though I consider it undesirable.

I've added PRs for Ruby (<https://github.com/ruby/ruby/pull/5959>) and StringIO (<https://github.com/ruby/stringio/pull/28>) for this.

#3 - 05/30/2022 04:00 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Applied in changeset [git|adaaf12857ce41d35b282e3fb5aa330934ce45c6](https://github.com/ruby/stringio/commit/feaa2ec631).

[ruby/stringio] Ignore chomp keyword for nil separator

nil separator means no separator at all, so nothing should be chomped.

Partial fix for Ruby [Bug #18770]

<https://github.com/ruby/stringio/commit/feaa2ec631>

#4 - 06/06/2022 05:38 PM - jeremyevans0 (Jeremy Evans)

- Status changed from Closed to Open

#5 - 07/21/2022 12:26 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

We discussed this at the dev meeting, and [@matz \(Yukihiro Matsumoto\)](#) agreed with [@jeremyevans0 \(Jeremy Evans\)](#).

#6 - 07/21/2022 03:13 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Applied in changeset [git|04f86ad0b5d2fe4711ff300d855228a6aed55f33](https://github.com/ruby/stringio/commit/04f86ad0b5d2fe4711ff300d855228a6aed55f33).

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]

#7 - 07/21/2022 03:34 PM - jeremyevans0 (Jeremy Evans)

- Status changed from Closed to Open

#8 - 07/21/2022 07:55 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Applied in changeset [git|7223c0da152114c84e1c4261a282faaea21646fb](https://github.com/ruby/stringio/commit/7223c0da152114c84e1c4261a282faaea21646fb).

Do not chomp trailing line separator IO#each with nil separator and chomp

nil separator means no separator, so chomp should not remove a line separator.

Partially Fixes [Bug #18770]