

Ruby - Bug #18837

Not possible to evaluate expression with numbered parameters in it

06/17/2022 12:48 PM - hurricup (Alexandr Evstigneev)

Status:	Rejected	
Priority:	Normal	
Assignee:		
Target version:		
ruby -v:		Backport: 2.7: UNKNOWN, 3.0: UNKNOWN, 3.1: UNKNOWN
Description <p>I presume it's not really a bug, but design flaw, but this is really frustrating. Use case is - debugger.</p> <p>Here is script with expected behavior:</p> <pre>def dumper(bnd) puts bnd.local_variable_get 'i' puts bnd.eval 'i * 10' end [1,2].each { i dumper(binding) }</pre> <p>And this one attempts to do the same with numbered params:</p> <pre>def dumper(bnd) puts bnd.local_variable_get('_1') puts bnd.eval '_1 * 10' end [1,2].each do some = _1 # without this line even local_variable_get won't work, still it may be in any place of block dumper(binding) end</pre> <p>But eval wont ever work and this necessity for using _1 so binding could see it may be confusing as well.</p>		
Related issues:		
Related to Ruby - Feature #15915: `@1` cannot be achieved in meta-programming		Closed
Related to Ruby - Feature #19137: Numbered parameters are not made available ...		Open
Has duplicate Ruby - Bug #20308: `it` and numbered parameters do not work in ...		Closed

History

#1 - 06/17/2022 01:46 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Related to Feature #15915: `@1` cannot be achieved in meta-programming added

#2 - 07/20/2022 01:58 AM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

I talked a bit with some of the committers.

[@ko1 \(Koichi Sasada\)](#) said that it is difficult to retrieve _1 afterwards due to the current implementation limitation, since the actual arguments may be dropped by optimization when a block that does not accept formal arguments is called.

Also, [@znz \(Kazuhiro NISHIYAMA\)](#) pointed out that the meta-programming API to read out only _1 is somewhat unreasonable, since the meaning of _1 depends on the presence of _2.

```
{ 1 => "A" }.each do
  p _1 #=> [1, "A"]
end
```

```
{ 1 => "A" }.each do
  p _1 #=> 1
  _2
end
```

end

#3 - 07/21/2022 12:28 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- *Status changed from Open to Rejected*

We discussed this issue at the dev meeting. [@matz \(Yukihiro Matsumoto\)](#) agreed that it is difficult to support this for the reasons I said in [#note-2](#).

#4 - 11/24/2022 05:06 PM - alanwu (Alan Wu)

- *Related to Feature #19137: Numbered parameters are not made available to IRB. added*

#5 - 02/28/2024 11:12 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- *Has duplicate Bug #20308: `it` and numbered parameters do not work in `eval` added*